

REBUKE: HOCHEI-ACH TOCHI-ACH

MONDAY, APRIL 28, 2003; 27 NISAN 5763; YOM HASHOAH
DC BEIT MIDRASH – WWW.DCBEITMIDRASH.ORG

Leviticus 19:17

You shall not hate your brother in your heart; you shall surely rebuke your neighbor, and not bear sin because of him.

לֹא-תִשְׂנֵא אֶת-אָחִיךָ, בְּלִבְבְּךָ; הִוְכַח תּוֹכִיחַ אֶת-עַמִּיתְךָ, וְלֹא-תִשָּׂא עָלָיו
חַטָּא.

1. WHY DO YOU HAVE TO REBUKE?

Ibn Ezra on this verse

“You shall not bear his sin” – because the punishment will be on you for his sin.

Talmud: Arachin 16b

How do we know that if a man sees something unseemly in his neighbor, he is obliged to reproof him? Because it is said, Hochei-ach. If he rebuked him and he did not accept it, where do we know that he must rebuke him again? The text states, Tochi-ach.

It was taught: R. Tarfon said, I wonder whether there is anyone in this generation who accepts reproof, for if one says to him “remove the mote from between your eyes,” he would answer, “remove the beam from between *your* eyes!” R. Eleazar B. Azariah said, “I wonder if there is one in this generation who knows how to reprove?”

R. Judah, son of Rabbi Simeon B. Pazzi asked of R. Simeon B. Pazzi, “what is preferable, reproof with honest purpose or false humility? He answered, “Won’t you agree that true humility is better for Rav said, humility is the greatest of them all.”

2. WHAT MAKES REBUKE DIFFICULT?

Tosefot on Arakin 16b

He makes himself humble and he does not wish to rebuke. This humility is not for the sake of heaven, but, rather his sole intent is that he will not be hated by the one he would have rebuked.

מסכת ברכות י

הנהו בריוני דהוו בשבבותיה דר"מ והוו קא מצערו ליה טובא הוה קא בעי ר' מאיר רחמי עלויהו כי היכי דלימותו אמרה ל' ברוריא דביתהו מאי דעתך משום דכתיב (תהילים קד) יתמו חטאים מי כתיב חוטאים חטאים כתיב ועוד שפיל לסיפיה דקרא ורשעים עוד אינם כיון דיתמו חטאים ורשעים עוד אינם אלא בעי רחמי עלויהו דלהדרו בתשובה ורשעים עוד אינם בעא רחמי עלויהו והדרו בתשובה:

Talmud: Brachot 10a

There were once some highway men in the neighborhood of R. Meir who caused him a great deal of trouble. R. Meir accordingly prayed that they should die. His wife, Bruriah said to him, "How do you make out that such a prayer should be permitted? Is it written 'Let the **s**inners [chot'im] cease!?' Rather, it is written, 'Let the **s**ins [chatta'im] cease!' (Psalms 104:35). Since the sins will cease there will be no more wicked men. Rather, pray for them that they should repent and there will be no more wicked." He did pray for them and they repented.

(Bruriah quotes from Psalms 104:35

יתמו חטאים מן-הארץ ורשעים עוד אינם; ברכי נפשי את-ה'; הללו-י-ה

Let sinners cease out of the earth, and let the wicked be no more. Bless the LORD, O my soul. Hallelujah.)

3. WHEN SHOULD YOU GIVE UP?

מסכת בבא מציעא לא.

א"ל ההוא מדרבנן לרבא ואימא (ויקרא יט) הוכח חדא זימנא תוכיח תרי זמני א"ל הוכח אפי' ק' פעמים משמע תוכיח אין לי אלא הרב לתלמיד תלמיד לרב מנין ת"ל הוכח תוכיח מ"מ

Talmud: Baba Metziah 31a

One of the rabbis said to Rabba, "You should not hate your brother in your heart, you shall surely rebuke your neighbor." Perhaps *hochei-ach* means once and *tochi-ach* means twice? He replied, "*Hochei-ach* implies even a hundred times as for *Tochi-ach*, I know only that the master must rebuke the disciple and where do we know that the disciple must rebuke his master, from the phrase *Hochei-ach Tochi-ach*, implying under all circumstances.

הלכות דעות פרק וז:

הרואה את חברו שחטא, או שהוא הולך בדרך לא טובה--מצוה להחזירו למוטב, ולהודיעו שהוא חוטא על עצמו במעשיו הרעים: שנאמר "הוכח תוכיח את עמיתך" (ויקרא יט, יז). המוכיח את חברו--בין בדברים שבינו לבינו, בין בדברים שבינו לבין המקום--צריך להוכיחו בינו לבין עצמו, וידבר לו בנחת ובלשון רכה, ויודיעו שאינו אומר לו אלא לטובתו, ולהביאו לחיי העולם הבא. אם קיבל ממנו, מוטב; ואם לאו, יוכיח פעם שנייה ושלישית. וכן תמיד חייב להוכיח, עד שיכהו החוטא ויאמר לו איני שומע; וכל שאפשר בידו למחות ואינו ממחה, הוא נתפס בעוון אלו כולם שאפשר לו למחות בהן.

Rambam Sefer Deot 6:7

If one observes that a person committed a sin or walks in a way that is not good, it is a duty to bring the erring man back to the right path and point out to him that he is wronging himself by his easy courses. As it is said, "You shall surely rebuke your neighbor." He who rebukes another, whether for offenses against the rebuker, himself or for sins against God, should administer the rebuke in private, speak to the offender gently and tenderly, and point out that he is only speaking for the wrongdoers' own good, to secure for him life in the world to come. If the latter accepts the rebuke, well and good. If not he should be rebuked a second time and a third time. And so one is bound to continue the admonitions until the sinner assaults the admonisher and says to him, "I refuse to listen." Whoever is in a position to prevent wrongdoing and does not do so is responsible for the inequity of all the wrong-doers whom he might have restrained.

מסכת יבמות סה:

ואמר רבי אילעא משום ר' אלעזר בר' שמעון כשם שמצוה על אדם לומר דבר הנשמע כך מצוה על אדם שלא לומר דבר שאינו נשמע רבי אבא אומר חובה שנאמר (משלי ט) אל תוכח לץ פן ישנאך הוכח לחכם ויאהבך

Talmud: Yevamot 65b

As one is commanded to say that which will be obeyed, so is one commanded not to say that which will not be obeyed. R. Abba stated, "It is a duty for it is set in scripture, reprove not a scorner lest he hate you, reprove a wise man and he will love you."

Kedoshim @ the DC Beit *Midrash*

Monday, April 28, 2003; 27 Nisan 5763; Yom Hashoah

Welcome to the DC Beit *Midrash*!

The *Chumash* (Five Books of Moses) is divided into 54 portions, which Jews read sequentially each week in services. This Shabbat, we will be reading Parshat *Kedoshim* from the book of *Vayikra* (Leviticus). Tonight, a member of our community will lead us in a text-study of this portion. The voices of both past and contemporary interpreters will inform our discussion.

Below you will find a summary of this week's *Torah* portion, along with brief biographies of the commentators cited. The presentation will be followed by *chevruta* (paired) study on a subject of your choice.

This week's parsha (Torah portion): Kedoshim, Vayikra (Leviticus), 19:1-20:27

Parshat Kedoshim, which means "holy," lists those rituals and ethical laws that, if followed, will make the Jewish people a "holy" people.

(Excerpted from Harvey Fields, *A Torah Commentary for Our Times*, p 127)

This week's sources:

Talmud Bavli (c. 500)

The Babylonian Talmud (Talmud Bavli) is a compilation of discussions on the *Mishna*, which had been going on some three hundred years already at the time they were written down. The Talmud's discussions are recorded in a consistent format: a law from the *Mishna* is cited, which is followed by rabbinic deliberations on its meaning (known as *Gemara*).

(Adapted from Telushkin, *Jewish Literacy*, p 150-153)

Rambam (1135-1204)

If one did not know that Rambam (Maimonides) was the name of a man, Abraham Joshua Heschel wrote, one would assume it was the name of a university. The writings and achievements of this twelfth century Jewish sage seem to cover an impossibly large number of activities. Maimonides was the first person to write a systematic code of all Jewish law, the *Mishneh Torah*; he produced one of the great philosophic statements of Judaism, *The Guide to the Perplexed*; published a commentary on the entire *Mishna*; served as physician to the sultan of Egypt; wrote numerous books on medicine; and, in his spare time, served as leader of Cairo's Jewish community.

Maimonides' major contribution to Jewish life remains the *Mishneh Torah*, his code of Jewish law. His intention was to compose a book that would guide Jews on how to behave in all situations without having to expend large amounts of time. Despite sometimes-intense opposition, the *Mishneh Torah* became a standard guide to Jewish practice, later serving as a model for the *Shulchan Arukh*, the 16th century code of Jewish law that many Jews still regard as authoritative.

(Adapted from www.us-israel.org/jsource/biography/Maimonides.html)

***Tosafot* (1100-1300)**

The word "*Tosafot*" translates as "additions" or "supplements." This probably means that their authors and editors saw their work as supplements to Rashi's basic commentary on the Talmud. The *Tosafot* were composed by many scholars in different schools throughout the 12th and 13th centuries in France and Germany.

Unlike the explanatory commentaries, such as Rashi's, the *Tosafot* do not attempt to provide a full elucidation of the Talmud text. Rather they focus on difficulties and contradictions—either between different statements and passages in the Talmud, between the Talmud and other Rabbinic works, or even between the Talmudic legal rulings and the customary practices of the French and German Jewish communities. In their efforts to resolve these apparent

(over)

contradictions, the *Tosafot* usually point out intricate new conceptual and legal distinctions that enhance our understanding of the text.

(Excerpted from Eliezer Segal's www.acs.ucalgary.ca/~elsegal/TalmudMap/Tosafot.html)

This week's teachers:

Leaders of the DC Beit Midrash

We are currently looking for teachers to sign up for upcoming weeks. Regardless of your background or level of knowledge, we encourage you to teach. We will gladly help you locate sources or prepare texts. Please remember, your participation is crucial for the continued vibrancy of our community! Email Joelle at jnovoy@post.harvard.edu.

This week's food sponsor:

Anonymous

This week's food shlepper:

Ethan Merlin

Wanna teach, think about teaching, or suggest a teacher? jnovoy@post.harvard.edu

Wanna sponsor food? Ariellabock@hotmail.com

Questions, feedback, wanna join our email list? Anything else? Email DCBeitMidrash@hotmail.com

WWW.DCBEITMIDRASH.ORG